Functional magnetic resonance imaging

Introduction

With cognitive, sensory, or motor stimulation, specific brain regions are activated, requiring higher energy use and higher levels of blood flow. Functional magnetic resonance imaging (fMRI) measures blood flow to determine activation and deactivation of the specific brain regions associated with particular tasks. fMRI results from people with bipolar disorder are compared to results from people without bipolar disorder or other comparison groups to help pinpoint the areas of the brain that are affected by the disorder.

Method

We have included only systematic reviews (systematic literature search, detailed methodology with inclusion/exclusion criteria) published in full text, in English, from the year 2010 that report results separately for people with a diagnosis of bipolar or related disorders. Reviews were identified by searching the MEDLINE, EMBASE, databases and PsycINFO. Hand searching reference lists of identified reviews was also conducted. When multiple copies of review topics were found, only the most recent and comprehensive version was included. Reviews with pooled data are prioritised for inclusion.

Review reporting assessment was guided by the Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Meta-Analyses (PRISMA) Reviews and checklist that describes a preferred way to present a meta-analysis. Reviews were assigned a low, medium or high possibility of reporting bias* depending on how many items were checked. Reviews rated as having less than 50% of items checked have now been excluded from the library. The PRISMA flow diagram is a suggested way of providing information about studies included and excluded with reasons for exclusion. Where no flow diagram has been presented by individual reviews, but identified studies have been described in the text, reviews have been checked for this item. Note that early reviews may have been guided by less stringent reporting checklists than the PRISMA, and that



some reviews may have been limited by journal guidelines.

Evidence was graded using the Grading of Recommendations Assessment, Development and Evaluation (GRADE) Working Group approach where high quality evidence such as that gained from randomised controlled trials (RCTs) may be downgraded to moderate or low if review and study quality is limited, if there is inconsistency in results, indirect comparisons, imprecise or sparse data and high probability of reporting bias. It may also be downgraded if risks associated with the intervention or other matter under review are high. Conversely, low quality evidence such as that gained from observational studies may be upgraded if effect sizes are large, there is a dose dependent or reasonably response if results are and direct with low consistent. precise associated risks (see end of table for an explanation of these terms)¹. The resulting table represents an objective summary of the available evidence, although the conclusions are solely the opinion of staff of NeuRA (Neuroscience Research Australia).

Results

We found 14 systematic reviews that met our inclusion criteria²⁻¹⁵.

Resting state

Compared to controls, moderate quality evidence finds people with bipolar disorder showed increased resting state activation in bilateral inferior frontal gyrus, bilateral insula extending into the striatum, right superior frontal gyrus, and right superior temporal gyrus. Decreased activation was found in bilateral precuneus. left cerebellum extending to the occipital cortex, left anterior cingulate cortex, and left superior temporal gyrus. Compared to people with major depression, people with bipolar disorder showed increased activity in the right insula, right medial prefrontal cortex, right fusiform gyrus, and bilateral striatum. Decreased activity was found in the left anterior

Functional magnetic resonance imaging

cingulate cortex, left lingual gyrus, bilateral precuneus/posterior cingulate gyrus, and the left superior temporal gyrus. Both disorders showed increased activity in the bilateral insula and medial prefrontal cortex, and decreased activity in the left cerebellum when compared to controls.

Moderate quality evidence finds bipolar disorder was characterized by reduced connectivity within the default network and increased connectivity within the affective and ventral-attention networks. Both decreased and increased connectivity was found within the frontoparietal network. Increased connectivity was found in bipolar disorder between the affective and default, ventral-attention. frontal-parietal. and thalamus networks. Increased connectivity was found between the ventral-attention and thalamus. default. frontoparietal. and sensorimotor networks. Decreased connectivity found between the was frontoparietal and default networks.

During any emotion or cognitive task

- Compared to controls, moderate quality evidence suggests decreased activation in adults with bipolar disorder in the inferior frontal gyrus during cognitive and emotion tasks, and during a mania phase. There were also decreases in the lingual gyrus during cognitive tasks and euthymia, and in the putamen during cognitive tasks. There were increases in activation in the medial temporal lobe, putamen, and pallidum during cognitive tasks and in the caudate.
- Compared age-matched to controls. evidence moderate quality suggests activation decreased in children and adolescents with bipolar disorder in the right ventrolateral prefrontal cortex, right dorsolateral prefrontal cortex, right superior frontal gyrus, right dorsal cingulate cortex, and right dorsal striatum. There was also increased activation in patients in the right limbic amygdala, right lobe, riaht parahippocampal right medial gyrus, prefrontal cortex, right subgenual cingulate



cortex, right somatosensory association cortex, left ventral striatum, left ventrolateral prefrontal cortex, left cerebellum, and left lentiform nucleus, putamen, and lateral globus pallidus.

- Compared to age-matched controls, moderate to low quality evidence suggests increased activation in children with a parent with bipolar disorder in the right dorsolateral prefrontal cortex, right insula, right inferior parietal lobule, and left cerebellum.
- Compared to children and adolescents with a parent with bipolar disorder, moderate to low quality evidence suggests decreased activation in children or adolescents with bipolar disorder in the right dorsolateral prefrontal cortex, right insula, and left cerebellum.
- Moderate to low quality evidence suggests more hypoactivation in the putamen of people with bipolar disorder compared to controls than in the putamen of people with major depressive disorder, post-traumatic stress disorder, or an anxiety disorder compared to controls. There were similar hypoactivation levels of in the prefrontal/insula and the inferior parietal clusters. There were similar levels of hyperactivation in the left amygdala/parahippocampal gyrus, the left thalamus, and the perigenual/dorsal anterior cingulate cortex.

During facial affect processing tasks

Compared to controls, moderate quality evidence suggests decreased activation in people with bipolar disorder in the bilateral ventrolateral prefrontal cortex, and increased activation in bilateral parahippocampal gyrus (including the amygdala), left putamen and left pulvinar. With fear-face stimuli, people with bipolar disorder showed decreased activation in bilateral inferior frontal gyri and the left anterior cingulated gyrus, and increased activation in the left parahippocampal gyrus, left putamen, and left pulvinar thalamus. With happy-face stimuli, people with bipolar disorder showed

Functional magnetic resonance imaging

decreased activation in the right anterior cingulated gyrus and increased activation in bilateral caudate and the left parahippocampal gyrus.

- Compared to age-matched controls, moderate to low quality evidence suggests decreased activation in children or adolescents in the left middle occipital gyrus, and the right inferior frontal gyrus, with increased activity in the right amygdala, right parahippocampal gyrus, left inferior frontal gyrus, and left putamen.
- Compared to adults with bipolar disorder, moderate to low quality evidence suggests increased activation in children or adolescents with bipolar disorder in the right amygdala.
- Compared to people with major depression, moderate quality evidence suggests decreased activation in people with bipolar disorder in the dorsal anterior cingulate gyrus, and increased activation in the parahippocampal (including the gyrus bilateral amygdala), ventral anterior cingulate gyri, and left pulvinar.
- Compared to people with schizophrenia moderate quality evidence suggests decreased activation in people with bipolar disorder in bilateral occipital cunei, and increased activation in the left thalamus pulvinar.

During cognitive control tasks (perceived task difficulty and effort)

 Compared to controls, moderate quality evidence suggests decreased activation in people with bipolar disorder in the right inferior frontal gyrus, the right caudate nucleus, the right angular gyrus, the left inferior temporal gyrus, the left inferior frontal gyrus and the left posterior cingulate gyrus. There was also increased activation in the left precentral, left superior frontal, and the right superior temporal gyrus of patients.

During executive functioning tasks

• Moderate quality evidence suggests reduced activation in the striatum, supplementary



motor area, precentral gyrus, left cerebral hemisphere, and left cerebellum and more activation in the left gyrus rectus and right middle temporal gyrus. During euthymia there was reduced activation in the striatum, left supplementary motor area, and right inferior parietal gyrus, and more activation in the left gyrus rectus, and right middle and superior temporal lobe. People with bipolar I disorder showed hypoactivation in the putamen, insula, amygdala, supplementary motor area, and left caudate nucleus, and hyperactivation the right superior temporal lobe and left superior frontal gyrus.

During response inhibition tasks

Moderate quality evidence suggests decreased activation in the right inferior frontal gyrus, left lentiform nucleus, left precuneus, and left postcentral gyrus, with no evidence of increased activation. During euthymia, patients showed decreased activation in the striatum, left supplementary motor area, right anterior cingulate cortex, left lentiform nucleus/putamen, right inferior frontal gyrus, left inferior parietal lobule, right inferior parietal lobule, and the left precuneus. Euthymic patients showed increased activation in the left superior temporal gyrus, right middle frontal gyrus, and in rostral parts of the right inferior frontal gyrus. During mania, patients showed decreased activation in the right inferior frontal gyrus, left medial frontal gyrus, and the anterior cingulate cortex, and increased activation in the right insula and bilateral basal ganglia.

During attention tasks

 Compared to age-matched controls, moderate quality evidence suggests decreased activation in children and adolescents with bipolar disorder in the right anterior cingulate cortex, right limbic areas (including the amygdala), right dorsolateral prefrontal cortex, right lentiform nucleus and right globus pallidus. Increased activation was found in the right middle frontal gyrus,

Functional magnetic resonance imaging



left insula, and bilateral ventrolateral prefrontal cortex of patients.

During working memory tasks

 Moderate quality evidence suggests decreased activation in the left precentral gyrus and left cerebellum, and increased activation in the left gyrus rectus, and right middle and superior temporal lobe. People with bipolar disorder in the euthymic state showed hypoactivation in the left precuneus, right inferior occipital gyrus, and dorsolateral prefrontal cortex, and hyperactivation in the left ventromedial prefrontal cortex and right superior temporal gyrus.

Functional magnetic resonance imaging



Alustiza I, Radua J, Pla M, Martin R, Ortuno F

Meta-analysis of functional magnetic resonance imaging studies of timing and cognitive control in schizophrenia and bipolar disorder: Evidence of a primary time deficit

Schizophrenia Research 2017; 188: 21-32

View online review abstract

Comparison	Brain activation during cognitive control tasks in people with bipolar disorder vs. controls. Cognitive control is defined as the level of perceived difficulty of the cognitive task and the subsequent mental effort that an individual applies to achieve the cognitive aim.
Summary of evidence	Moderate quality evidence (large sample, some inconsistency, unable to assess precision, direct) suggests there are decreases in activation in patients in the right inferior frontal gyrus (BA 47), the right caudate nucleus, the right angular gyrus (BA 7), the left inferior temporal gyrus (BA 20), the left inferior frontal gyrus (BA 47), and the left posterior cingulate gyrus (BA 30). There were increases in activation in the left precentral (BA 6), left superior frontal (BA 10), and the right superior temporal gyrus (BA 42).
	Cognitive control tasks
	12 studies, N = 772
Significant, decreased activation in people with bipolar disorder was found in;	
Right inferior frontal gyrus (orbital part, BA 47)	
Right caudate nucleus	
Right angular gyrus (BA 7)	
Left inferior temporal gyrus (BA 20)	
Left inferior frontal gyrus (orbital part, BA 47)	
Left posterior cingulate gyrus (BA 30)	
Significant, increased activation in people with bipolar disorder was found in;	
	Left precentral (BA 6)
	Left superior frontal (BA 10)
	Right superior temporal (BA 42)
There was no evidence of publication bias.	



Functional magnetic resonance imaging

Consistency in results [‡]	Authors report that decreased activation in the right inferior frontal gyrus and caudate nucleus were found in all combinations of studies, indicating consistency for those regions.
Precision in results [§]	Unable to assess; no measure of precision is reported (CIs).
Directness of results	Direct

Chen CH, Suckling J, Lennox BR, Ooi C, Bullmore ET

A quantitative meta-analysis of fMRI studies in bipolar disorder

Bipolar Disorders 2011; 13: 1-15

View online review abstract

Comparison	Brain activation in people with bipolar disorder vs. controls.
Summary of evidence	Moderate quality evidence (large sample, unable to assess consistency or precision, direct) suggests decreases in activation in the inferior frontal gyrus during cognitive and emotion tasks and during a mania phase in people with bipolar disorder. There were also decreases in the lingual gyrus during cognitive tasks and euthymia, and the putamen during cognitive tasks. There were increases in activation in the medial temporal lobe, putamen, and pallidum during cognitive tasks, and in the caudate during no specific task paradigm.
Cognitive and emotion tasks	
50 studies, N = 1,576	
Significant, decreased activation in people with bipolar disorder was found in;	
Overall	
Inferior frontal gyrus	
Lingual gyrus	
Putamen	
During cognitive tasks	
Inferior frontal gyrus	
	Lingual gyrus
	Putamen
During emotion tasks	

NeuRA Functional magnetic resonance imaging

Functional magnetic resonance imaging



Inferior frontal gyrus	
During euthymia	
Lingual gyrus	
During mania	
Inferior frontal gyrus	
Significant, increased activation in people with bipolar disorder was found in;	
Overall	
Medial temporal lobe (including the parahippocampus, hippocampus and amydala)	
Putamen	
Pallidum	
Caudate	
During emotion tasks	
Medial temporal lobe (including the parahippocampus, hippocampus and amydala)	
Putamen	
Pallidum	
Consistency in results	Unable to assess; no measure of consistency is reported.
Precision in results	Unable to assess; no measure of precision is reported (CIs).
Directness of results	Direct

Delvecchio G, Fossati P, Boyer P, Brambilla P, Falkai P, Gruber O, Hietala J, Lawrie SM, Martinot JL, McIntosh AM, Meisenzahl E, Frangou S

Common and distinct neural correlates of emotional processing in Bipolar Disorder and Major Depressive Disorder: a voxel-based meta-analysis of functional magnetic resonance imaging studies

European Neuropsychopharmacology 2012; 22: 100-13

View online review abstract

Comparison 1	Brain activation during facial affect processing in people with bipolar disorder vs. controls.



Functional magnetic resonance imaging

Summary of evidence	Moderate quality evidence (large sample, unable to assess consistency or precision, direct) suggests people with bipolar disorder showed decreased activation in bilateral ventrolateral prefrontal cortex within the inferior frontal gyrus (BA47), and increased activation in bilateral parahippocampal gyrus (including the amygdala), left putamen and left pulvinar. With fear-face stimuli, people with bipolar disorder showed decreased activation in bilateral inferior frontal gyri (BA47/45) and the left anterior cingulated gyrus (BA32), and increased activation in the left parahippocampal gyrus (BA 28 and 35), left putamen, and left pulvinar thalamus.	
	With happy-face stimuli, people with bipolar disorder showed decreased activation in the right anterior cingulated gyrus (BA32) and increased activation in bilateral caudate and left parahippocampal gyrus (BA34).	
Facial affect processing		
14 studies, N = 379		
Significant, decreased activation in people with bipolar disorder was found in;		
Bilateral ventrolateral prefrontal cortex within the inferior frontal gyri (BA47)		
Subgroup analysis of fear faces found people with bipolar disorder showed <i>decreased</i> activation in bilateral inferior frontal gyri (BA47/45), and the left anterior cingulated gyrus (BA32).		
Subgroup analysis of happy faces found people with bipolar disorder showed <i>decreased</i> activation in the right anterior cingulated gyrus (BA32).		
Significant increased activation in people with bipolar disorder was found in;		
Bilateral parahippocampal gyri (including the amygdala)		
Left putamen		
Left pulvinar		
Subgroup analysis of fear faces found people with bipolar disorder showed <i>increased</i> activation in the left parahippocampal gyrus (BA 28 and 35), left putamen, and left pulvinar thalamus.		
Subgroup analysis of happy faces found people with bipolar disorder showed <i>increased</i> activation in bilateral caudate and left parahippocampal gyrus (BA34).		
Comparison 2	Brain activation during facial affect processing in people with bipolar disorder vs. people with major depression.	
Summary of evidence	Moderate quality evidence (large sample, unable to assess consistency or precision, direct) suggests people with bipolar disorder showed decreased activation in the dorsal anterior cingulate gyrus, and increased activation in the parahippocampal gyrus (including the amygdala), bilateral	

NeuRA Functional magnetic resonal	Ince imaging
-----------------------------------	--------------

Functional magnetic resonance imaging



ventral anterior cingulate gyri, and left pulvinar.		
Facial affect processing		
N = 357		
Significant decreased activation in people with bipolar disorder was found in;		
Dorsal anterior cingulate gyrus		
Significant increased activation in people with bipolar disorder was found in;		
Parahippocampal gyrus (including the amygdala)		
Bilateral ventral anterior cingulate gyri		
Left pulvinar		
There were no direct comparisons between bipolar disorder and major depression for fear vs. happy faces.		
Consistency in results	Unable to assess; no measure of consistency is reported.	
Precision in results	Unable to assess; no measure of precision is reported (CIs).	
Directness of results	Direct	

Delvecchio G, Sugranyes G, Frangou S

Evidence of diagnostic specificity in the neural correlates of facial affect processing in bipolar disorder and schizophrenia: a meta-analysis of functional imaging studies

Psychological Medicine 2013; 43(3): 553-69

View review abstract online

Comparison	Brain activation during facial affect processing in people with bipolar disorder vs. people with schizophrenia.
Summary of evidence	Moderate quality evidence (large sample size, direct, unable to assess precision or consistency) suggests people with bipolar disorder show decreased activation in bilateral occipital cunei and increased activation in the left thalamus pulvinar.
	Facial affect processing
	29 studies, 1,018
Significant deci	reased activation in people with bipolar disorder was found in;

Functional magnetic resonance imaging



Bilateral occipital cuneus (BA18)	
Significant increased activation in people with bipolar disorder was found in;	
Left thalamus pulvinar	
Differences between the two disorders in amygdala activation were negatively correlated with antipsychotic dose. Age and sex did not contribute to differences between diagnostic groups.	
Consistency in results	Unable to assess; no measure of consistency is reported.
Precision in results	Unable to assess; no measure of precision is reported (CIs).
Directness of results	Direct

Gong J, Qiu S, Chen P, Luo Z, Wang J, Huang L, Wang Y

Common and distinct patterns of intrinsic brain activity alterations in major depression and bipolar disorder: voxel-based meta-analysis

Translational Psychiatry 2020; 10: 353

View review abstract online

Comparison	Whole brain resting state activity in people with bipolar disorder or major depression vs. controls.
Summary of evidence	Moderate quality evidence (large sample size, direct, unable to assess precision or consistency) finds people with bipolar disorder compared to controls show increased resting state activation in bilateral inferior frontal gyrus, bilateral insula extending into the striatum, right superior frontal gyrus, and right superior temporal gyrus. Decreased activation in bipolar disorder compared to controls was found in bilateral precuneus, left cerebellum extending to the occipital cortex, left anterior cingulate cortex, and left superior temporal gyrus. When compared to people with depression, people with bipolar disorder showed increased activity in the right insula, right medial prefrontal cortex, right fusiform gyrus, and bilateral striatum. When compared to people with depression, people with bipolar disorder showed decreased activity in the left anterior cingulate cortex, left lingual gyrus, bilateral precuneus/posterior cingulate gyrus, and the left superior temporal gyrus. Both disorders showed increased activity in the bilateral insula and medial prefrontal cortex, and decreased activity in the left cerebellum when compared to controls.

NeuRA Functional magnetic resonance imaging

Functional magnetic resonance imaging



Resting state activity 15 studies of bipolar disorder vs. controls, N = 1,087 People with bipolar disorder had increased amplitude of low-frequency fluctuation compared to controls in: Bilateral inferior frontal gyrus Bilateral insula extending into the striatum Right superior frontal gyrus Right superior temporal gyrus People with bipolar disorder had decreased amplitude of low-frequency fluctuation compared to controls in: **Bilateral precuneus** Left cerebellum extending to the occipital cortex Left anterior cingulate cortex Left superior temporal gyrus 50 studies of major depression vs. controls, N = 2,731 People with major depression had increased amplitude of low-frequency fluctuation compared to controls in: Right superior frontal gyrus including the medial orbitofrontal cortex and medial prefrontal cortex Anterior cingulate cortex Bilateral insula extending into the striatum and left supramarginal gyrus People with major depression had decreased amplitude of low-frequency fluctuation compared to controls in: **Bilateral cerebellum Bilateral precuneus** Left occipital cortex Comparison of bipolar disorder vs. major depression People with bipolar disorder had increased amplitude of low-frequency fluctuation compared to people with major depression in; **Right insula** Right medial prefrontal cortex Right fusiform gyrus **Bilateral striatum** People with bipolar disorder had decreased amplitude of low-frequency fluctuation compared to people with major depression in;

NeuRA Functional magnetic resonance imaging

Functional magnetic resonance imaging



Left anterior cingulate cortex	
Left lingual gyrus	
Bilateral precuneus/posterior cingulate gyrus	
Left superior temporal gyrus	
Conjunction analysis showed increased amplitude of low-frequency fluctuation in the bilateral insula and medial prefrontal cortex, and decreased amplitude of low-frequency fluctuation in the left cerebellum in both disorders.	
Consistency in results	Unable to assess; no measure of consistency is reported.
Precision in results	Unable to assess; no measure of precision is reported (CIs).
Directness of results	Direct

Gong J, Chen P, Qi Z, Luo Z, Wang J, Huang L, Wang Y

Large-scale network abnormality in bipolar disorder: A multimodal metaanalysis of resting-state functional and structural magnetic resonance imaging studies

Journal of Affective Disorders 2021; 292: 9-20

View review abstract online

Comparison	Whole brain resting state connectivity in people with bipolar disorder vs. controls.
Summary of evidence	Moderate quality evidence (large sample size, direct, unable to assess precision or consistency) finds bipolar disorder was characterized by reduced connectivity <i>within</i> the default network and increased connectivity <i>within</i> the affective and ventral- attention networks. Both decreased and increased connectivity was found <i>within</i> the frontoparietal network.
	Increased connectivity was found in bipolar disorder <i>between</i> the affective and default, frontoparietal, ventral-attention, and thalamus networks. Increased connectivity was found <i>between</i> the ventral-attention and thalamus, default, frontoparietal, and sensorimotor networks. Decreased connectivity was found <i>between</i> the frontoparietal and default networks.
Resting state network connectivity	
36 studies, N = 3,084	

Functional magnetic resonance imaging



Within networks

Bipolar disorder was characterized by reduced connectivity within the default network and increased connectivity within the affective network, and ventral attention network. Both decreased and increased connectivity was found within the frontoparietal network.

Between networks

Increased connectivity was found in bipolar disorder between the affective and default, frontoparietal, ventral-attention, and thalamus networks. Increased connectivity was found between the ventral-attention and thalamus, default, frontoparietal, and sensorimotor networks. Decreased connectivity was found between the frontoparietal and default networks.

Consistency in results	Unable to assess; no measure of consistency is reported.
Precision in results	Unable to assess; no measure of precision is reported (CIs).
Directness of results	Direct

Hajek T, Alda M, Hajek E, Ivanoff J

Functional neuroanatomy of response inhibition in bipolar disorders -Combined voxel based and cognitive performance meta-analysis

Journal of Psychiatric Research 2013; 47: 1955-66

View online review abstract

Comparison	Brain activation during response inhibition tasks in people with bipolar disorder vs. controls.
Summary of evidence	Moderate quality evidence (large sample, unable to assess consistency or precision, direct) suggests people with bipolar disorder showed decreased activation in the right inferior frontal gyrus (BA47), left basal ganglia (lentiform nucleus), left precuneus (BA7), and left postcentral gyrus (BA40), with no evidence of increased activation.
	During euthymia, patients showed decreased activation in the left lentiform nucleus/putamen, right inferior frontal gyrus (BA 47), left inferior parietal lobule (BA 40), right inferior parietal lobule, (BA 7), and the left precuneus (BA 7), and increased activation in the left superior temporal gyrus (BA 39), right middle frontal gyrus (BA 10), and in rostral parts of the right inferior frontal gyrus (BA 46).
	During mania, patients showed decreased activation in the right inferior frontal gyrus (BA 47), left medial frontal gyrus (BA9),

Functional magnetic resonance imaging



	and the anterior cingulate cortex (BA32), and increased activation in the right insula (BA 13) and bilateral basal ganglia.	
Response inhibition tasks		
Significant, decreased activation in people with bipolar disorder was found in;		
Overall		
30 studies, N = 1,302		
Right inferior frontal gyrus (BA47)		
	Left basal ganglia (lentiform nucleus)	
Left precuneus (BA7)		
Left postcentral gyrus (BA40)		
	During euthymia	
12 studies, N = 604		
Left lentiform nucleus/putamen		
	Right inferior frontal gyrus (BA 47)	
	Left inferior parietal lobule (BA 40)	
Right inferior parietal lobule, (BA 7)		
Left precuneus (BA 7)		
During mania		
10 studies, N = 298		
Right inferior frontal gyrus (BA 47)		
	Left medial frontal gyrus (BA9)	
Anterior cingulate cortex (BA32)		
Significant, increased activation in people with bipolar disorder was found in;		
During euthymia		
12 studies, N = 604		
Left superior temporal gyrus (BA 39)		
Right middle frontal gyrus (BA 10)		
Rostral parts of the right inferior frontal gyrus (BA 46)		
	During mania	
	10 studies, N = 298	
	Right insula (BA 13)	
	Bilateral basal ganglia	
Consistency in results	Unable to assess; no measure of consistency is reported.	

NeuRA Functional magnetic resonance imaging

Functional magnetic resonance imaging



Precision in results	Unable to assess; no measure of precision is reported (CIs).
Directness of results	Direct

Janiri D, Moser DA, Doucet GE, Luber MJ, Rasgon A, Lee WH, Murrough JW, Sani G, Eickhoff SB, Frangou S

Shared Neural Phenotypes for Mood and Anxiety Disorders: A Metaanalysis of 226 Task-Related Functional Imaging Studies

JAMA Psychiatry 2019; 77(2): 172-179

View online review abstract

Comparison	Similarities in brain activation during any task performance in people with bipolar disorder vs. major depressive disorder, post-traumatic stress disorder, or an anxiety disorder.		
Summary of evidence	Moderate to low quality evidence (large sample, unable to assess consistency or precision, indirect) suggests more hypoactivation in the putamen of people with bipolar disorder compared to controls than in the putamen of people with major depressive disorder, post-traumatic stress disorder, or an anxiety disorder. There were similar levels of hypoactivation in the prefrontal/insula and the inferior parietal clusters. There were similar levels of hyperactivation in the left amygdala/parahippocampal gyrus, the left thalamus, and the perigenual/dorsal anterior cingulate cortex.		
Cognitive tasks			
	226 studies, N = 9,262		
More hypoactivation was found in the putamen of people with bipolar disorder vs. controls than;			
Major depressive disorder: 72.17% vs. 17.35%, $p = 0.02$			
Post-traumatic stress disorder: 72.17% vs. 4.55%, $p = 0.06$			
Anxiety disorders: 72.17% vs. 5.93%, <i>p</i> = 0.03			
Similar levels of hypoactivation were found across all diagnoses (vs. controls) in;			
Prefrontal/insula			
Inferior parietal clusters			
Similar levels of hyperactivation were found across all diagnoses (vs. controls) in;			
Left amygdala/parahippocampal gyrus			



Functional magnetic resonance imaging

Left thalamus	
Perigenual/dorsal anterior cingulate cortex	
Consistency in results	Unable to assess; no measure of consistency is reported.
Precision in results	Unable to assess; no measure of precision is reported (CIs).
Directness of results	Indirect

Lee MS, Anumagalla P, Talluri P, Pavuluri MN

Meta-analyses of developing brain function in high-risk and emerged bipolar disorder

Frontiers in Psychiatry 2014; 5: 141

View online review abstract

Comparison 1	Brain activation during any emotion or cognitive task in children and adolescents with bipolar disorder (<19 years) vs. age-matched controls.
Summary of evidence	Moderate quality evidence (large sample, unable to assess consistency or precision, direct) suggests children or adolescents with bipolar disorder showed decreased activation in the right ventrolateral prefrontal cortex, right dorsolateral prefrontal cortex, right superior frontal gyrus, right dorsal cingulate cortex, and right dorsal striatum. There was increased activation in the right right limbic lobe (including the amygdala and parahippocampal gyrus), right medial prefrontal cortex, right subgenual cingulate cortex, right somatosensory association cortex, left ventral striatum, left ventrolateral prefrontal cortex, left cerebellum, and left lentiform nucleus, putamen, and lateral globus pallidus.
Cognitive or emotion tasks	
26 studies, N = 947	
Significant, decreased activation in children or adolescents with bipolar disorder was found in;	
Right ventrolateral prefrontal cortex	
Right dorsolateral prefrontal cortex	
Right superior frontal gyrus	
Right dorsal cingulate cortex	

NeuRA Functional magnetic resonance imaging

Functional magnetic resonance imaging



Right dorsal striatum		
Significant, increased activation in children or adolescents with bipolar disorder was found in;		
Right limbic lobe (including the amygdala and parahippocampal gyrus)		
Right medial prefrontal cortex		
Right subgenual cingulate cortex		
	Right somatosensory association cortex	
	Left ventral striatum	
	Left ventrolateral prefrontal cortex	
	Left cerebellum	
Left lentiform nucleus, putamen, and lateral globus pallidus		
Comparison 2	Brain activation during any emotion or cognitive task in children and adolescents with a parent with bipolar disorder vs. age- matched controls.	
Summary of evidence	Moderate to low quality evidence (medium-sized sample) suggests children or adolescents with a parent with bipolar disorder showed increased activation in the right dorsolateral prefrontal cortex, right insula, right inferior parietal lobule, and left cerebellum.	
	Cognitive or emotion tasks	
	6 studies, N = 220	
Significant, increased active	ation in children or adolescents with a parent with bipolar disorder was found in;	
Right dorsolateral prefrontal cortex		
Right insula		
Right inferior parietal lobule		
Left cerebellum		
Comparison 3	Brain activation during any emotion or cognitive task in children and adolescents with bipolar disorder vs. children and adolescents with a parent with bipolar disorder.	
Summary of evidence	Moderate to low quality evidence (unclear sample) suggests children or adolescents with bipolar disorder showed decreased activation in the right dorsolateral prefrontal cortex, right insula, and left cerebellum.	
Cognitive or emotion tasks		

NeuRA Functional magnetic resonance imaging

Functional magnetic resonance imaging



6 studies, N = unclear		
Significant, decreased activation in children or adolescents with bipolar disorder was found in;		
Right dorsolateral prefrontal cortex		
Right insula		
Left cerebellum		
Consistency in results	Unable to assess; no measure of consistency is reported.	
Precision in results	Unable to assess; no measure of precision is reported (CIs).	
Directness of results	Direct	

Lee MS, Anumagalla P, Talluri P, Pavuluri MN

Attentional engagement increases inferior frontal gyrus activity and mutes limbic activity in pediatric bipolar disorder: Meta-analyses of fMRI studies

Progress in Neuropsychopharmacology and Biological Psychiatry 2018; May

View online review abstract

Comparison	Brain activation during attention tasks in children and adolescents with bipolar disorder vs. age-matched controls.	
Summary of evidence	Moderate quality evidence (medium to large sample, unable to assess consistency or precision, direct) suggests children or adolescents with bipolar disorder showed decreased activation in the right anterior cingulate cortex, right limbic areas (including the amygdala), right dorsolateral prefrontal cortex, right lentiform nucleus and right globus pallidus. Increased activation in children or adolescents with bipolar disorder was found in the right middle frontal gyrus, left insula, and bilateral ventrolateral prefrontal cortex.	
Attention tasks		
10 studies, N = 358		
Significant, decreased activation in children or adolescents with bipolar disorder was found in;		
Right anterior cingulate cortex		
Right limbic areas (including the amygdala)		
Right dorsolateral prefrontal cortex		

Functional magnetic resonance imaging



Right lentiform nucleus		
Right globus pallidus		
Significant, increased activation in children or adolescents with bipolar disorder was found in;		
Right middle frontal gyrus		
Left insula		
Bilateral ventrolateral prefrontal cortex		
Consistency in results	Unable to assess; no measure of consistency is reported.	
Precision in results	Unable to assess; no measure of precision is reported (CIs).	
Directness of results	Direct	

Sprooten E, Rasgon A, Goodman M, Carlin A, Leibu E, Lee WH, Frangou S

Addressing reverse inference in psychiatric neuroimaging: Meta-analyses of task-related brain activation in common mental disorders

Human Brain Mapping 38: 2017; 1846-64

View online review abstract

Comparison	Correlations between anomalies in brain activation during any task performance in people with bipolar disorder and people with other psychiatric disorders.
Summary of evidence	Moderate to low quality evidence (large sample, unable to assess consistency or precision, indirect) suggests medium to large correlations between the spatial distribution of brain activation anomalies in people with bipolar disorder and people with other psychiatric disorders.

Cognitive tasks

537 studies, N = 10,445

Significant, medium to large correlations between spatial distribution of brain activity anomalies in people with bipolar disorder vs. controls, and people with other psychiatric disorders vs. controls;

Bipolar disorder and schizophrenia: r = 0.80, p < 0.00001

Bipolar disorder and major depression: r = 0.79, p < 0.00001

Bipolar disorder and anxiety disorders: r = 0.76, p < 0.00001

Bipolar disorder and obsessive-compulsive disorder: r = 0.53, p < 0.00001



Functional magnetic resonance imaging

Consistency in results	Unable to assess; no measure of consistency is reported.
Precision in results	Unable to assess; no measure of precision is reported (CIs).
Directness of results	Indirect comparison of disorders.

Tian F, Diao W, Yang X, Wang X, Roberts N, Feng C, Jia Z

Failure of activation of striatum during the performance of executive function tasks in adult patients with bipolar disorder

Psychological medicine 2020; 50(4): 653-655

View online review abstract

	I.	
Comparison	Brain activation during executive functioning in people with bipolar disorder vs. controls.	
Summary of evidence	Moderate quality evidence (large sample, unable to assess consistency or precision, direct) suggests reduced activation in the striatum, supplementary motor area, precentral gyrus, left cerebral hemisphere, and left cerebellum and more activation in the left gyrus rectus and right middle temporal gyrus of people with bipolar disorder during executive functioning tasks. During euthymia there was reduced activation in the striatum, left supplementary motor area, and right inferior parietal gyrus, and more activation in the left gyrus rectus, and right middle and superior temporal lobe. People with bipolar I disorder showed hypoactivation in the putamen, insula, amygdala, supplementary motor area, and left caudate nucleus, and hyperactivation the right superior temporal lobe and left superior frontal gyrus.	
	During working memory tasks, there was reduced activation in the left precentral gyrus, and left cerebellum, and increased activation in the left gyrus rectus, and right middle and superior temporal gyrus. People with bipolar disorder in the euthymic state showed hypoactivation in the left precuneus, right inferior occipital gyrus, and dorsolateral prefrontal cortex, and hyperactivation in the left ventromedial prefrontal cortex and right superior temporal gyrus.	
	During inhibition tasks there was reduced activation in the left and right putamen, left supplementary motor area and right inferior frontal gyrus. During euthymia, there was reduced activation in the striatum, left supplementary motor area, and right anterior cingulate cortex.	
Executive functioning tasks		

NeuRA	Functional	magnetic	resonance	imaging
-------	------------	----------	-----------	---------

Functional magnetic resonance imaging



19 studies, N = 947 All tasks People with bipolar disorder showed hypoactivation in; **Bilateral striatum** Supplementary motor area Precentral gyrus Left cerebral hemisphere Left cerebellum People with bipolar disorder showed hyperactivation in; Left gyrus rectus Right middle temporal gyrus People with bipolar disorder in the euthymic state showed hypoactivation in; **Bilateral striatum** Left supplementary motor area Right inferior parietal gyrus People with bipolar disorder in the euthymic state showed hyperactivation in; Left gyrus rectus Right middle temporal gyrus Right superior temporal gyrus People with bipolar disorder I showed hypoactivation in; Putamen Insula Amygdala Supplementary motor area Caudate nucleus of the left cerebral hemisphere People with bipolar disorder I showed hyperactivation in; **Right superior temporal** Left superior frontal gyrus During working memory tasks People with bipolar disorder showed hypoactivation in; Left precentral gyrus Left cerebellum People with bipolar disorder showed hyperactivation in;

NeuRA Functional magnetic resonance imaging

Functional magnetic resonance imaging



	Left gyrus rectus	
Right middle and superior temporal gyrus		
People with bipolar disorder in the euthymic state showed hypoactivation in;		
	Left precuneus	
	Right inferior occipital gyrus	
	Dorsolateral prefrontal cortex	
People with bipolar disorder in the euthymic state showed hyperactivation in;		
Left ventromedial prefrontal cortex		
Right superior temporal gyrus		
During inhibition tasks		
People with bipolar disorder showed hypoactivation in;		
Left and right putamen		
Left supplementary motor area		
Right inferior frontal gyrus		
People with bipolar disorder in the euthymic state showed hypoactivation in;		
Bilateral striatum		
Left supplementary motor area		
Right anterior cingulate cortex		
Consistency in results	Authors report some inconsistency.	
Precision in results	Unable to assess; no measure of precision is reported (CIs).	
Directness of results	Direct	

Wegbreit E, Cushman GK, Puzia ME, Weissman AB, Kim KL, Laird AR, Dickstein DP

Developmental meta-analyses of the functional neural correlates of bipolar disorder

JAMA Psychiatry 2014; 71: 926-35

View online review abstract

Comparison 1	Brain activation during facial affect processing in children and	
	adolescents with bipolar disorder vs. controls.	

NeuRA Functional magnetic resonance imaging

Functional magnetic resonance imaging



Summary of evidence	Moderate to low quality evidence (unclear sample, unable to assess consistency or precision, direct) suggests decreased activity in left middle occipital gyrus, and right inferior frontal gyrus, and increased activity in the right amygdale, right parahippocampal gyrus, left inferior frontal gyrus, and left putamen of youth with bipolar disorder.	
Facial affect processing		
	6 studies, N = unclear	
Significant, decreased ac	tivation in children or adolescents with bipolar disorder was found in;	
	Left middle occipital gyrus	
	Right inferior frontal gyrus	
Significant, increased activation in children or adolescents with bipolar disorder was found in;		
Right amygdala		
Right parahippocampal gyrus		
	Left inferior frontal gyrus	
Left putamen		
Comparison 2	Brain activation during facial affect processing in adults with bipolar disorder vs. controls.	
Summary of evidence	Moderate to low quality evidence (unclear sample, unable to assess consistency or precision, direct) suggests decreased activity in the bilateral amygdala, bilateral inferior frontal gyrus, and left pregenual anterior cingulate cortex, and increased activity in the left amygdala, bilateral striatum, and left inferior frontal gyrus of adults with bipolar disorder.	
	Facial affect processing	
	24 studies, N = unclear	
Significant, decreased activation in adults with bipolar disorder was found in;		
Bilateral amygdala		
Bilateral inferior frontal gyrus		
Left pregenual anterior cingulate cortex		
Significant, increased activation in adults with bipolar disorder was found in;		
Left amygdala		
Bilateral striatum		
	Left inferior frontal gyrus	
Comparison 3	Brain activation during facial affect processing in children and	

NeuRA Functional magnetic resonance imaging

Functional magnetic resonance imaging



	adolescents with bipolar disorder vs. adults with bipolar disorder.	
Summary of evidence	Moderate to low quality evidence (unclear sample, unable to assess consistency or precision, direct) suggests increased activity in the right amygdala of youth with bipolar disorder.	
Facial affect processing		
Number of studies is unclear		
Significant, increased activation in children or adolescents with bipolar disorder was found in;		
Right amygdala		
Consistency in results	Unable to assess; no measure of consistency is reported.	
Precision in results	Unable to assess; no measure of precision is reported (CIs).	
Directness of results	Direct	

Yaple ZA, Tolomeo S, Yu R

Mapping working memory-specific dysfunction using a transdiagnostic approach

NeuroImage: Clinical 2021; 31: 102747

View online review abstract

Comparison	Brain activity during working memory tasks in people with bipolar disorder vs. controls.	
Summary of evidence	Moderate quality evidence (large sample, unable to assess consistency or precision, direct) showed reduced activity in the left superior frontal gyrus and bilateral middle frontal gyrus during working memory tasks in people with bipolar disorder.	
	Working memory tasks	
	12 studies, N = 431	
Peop	le with bipolar disorder showed reduced activity in;	
	Left superior frontal gyrus (BA 8)	
	Right middle Frontal gyrus (BA 6)	
	Left middle Frontal gyrus (BA 6)	

NeuRA Functional magnetic resonance imaging



Functional magnetic resonance imaging

Consistency in results	Unable to assess; no measure of consistency is reported.
Precision in results	Unable to assess; no measure of precision is reported (CIs).
Directness of results	Direct

Explanation of acronyms

BA = Brodmann's area, CI = confidence interval, N = number of participants, $p = p$	probability of
obtaining that result ($p < 0.05$ generally regarded as significant), vs. = versus.	

Functional magnetic resonance imaging



Explanation of technical terms

* Bias has the potential to affect reviews of both RCT and observational studies. Forms of bias include; reporting bias - selective reporting of results, publication bias - trials that are not formally published tend to show less effect than published trials, further if there are statistically significant differences between groups in a trial, these trial results tend to get published before those of trials without significant differences: language bias - only including English language reports; funding bias - source of funding for the primary research with selective reporting of results within primary studies; outcome variable selection bias; database bias including reports from some databases and not others; citation bias - preferential citation of authors. Trials can also be subject to bias when evaluators are not blind to treatment condition and selection bias of participants if trial samples are small¹⁶.

† Different effect measures are reported by different reviews.

Prevalence refers to how many existing cases there are at a particular point in time. Incidence refers to how many new cases there are per population in a specified time period. Incidence is usually reported as the number of new cases per 100,000 people per year. Alternatively some studies present the number of new cases that have accumulated over several years against a person-years denominator. This denominator is the sum of individual units of time that the persons in the population are at risk of becoming a case. It takes into account the size of the underlying population sample and its age structure over the duration of observation.

Weighted mean difference scores refer to mean differences between treatment and

comparison groups after treatment (or occasionally pre to post treatment) and in a randomised trial there is an assumption that both groups are comparable on this measure prior to treatment. Standardised mean differences are divided by the pooled standard deviation (or the standard deviation of one group when groups are homogenous) that allows results from different scales to be combined and compared. Each study's mean difference is then given a weighting depending on the size of the sample and the variability in the data. 0.2 represents a small effect, 0.5 a medium effect, and 0.8 and over represents a large treatment effect¹⁶.

Reliability and validity refers to how accurate the instrument is. Sensitivity is the proportion of actual positives that are correctly identified (100% sensitivity = correct identification of all actual positives) and specificity is the proportion of negatives that are correctly identified (100% specificity = not identifying anyone as positive if they are truly not).

Odds ratio (OR) or relative risk (RR) refers to the probability of a reduction (< 1) or an increase (> 1) in a particular outcome in a treatment group, or a group exposed to a risk factor, relative to the comparison group. For example, a RR of 0.75 translates to a reduction in risk of an outcome of 25% relative to those not receiving the treatment or not exposed to the risk factor. Conversely, an RR of 1.25 translates to an increased risk of 25% relative to those not receiving treatment or not having been exposed to a risk factor. An RR or OR of 1.00 means there is no difference between groups. A medium effect is considered if RR > 2 or < 0.5 and a large effect if RR > 5 or < 0.2^{17} . InOR stands for logarithmic OR where a InOR of 0 shows no difference between groups. Hazard ratios measure the effect of an explanatory variable on the hazard or risk of an event.

Correlation coefficients (eg, r) indicate the strength of association or relationship



Functional magnetic resonance imaging

between variables. They are an indication of prediction, but do not confirm causality due to possible and often unforseen confounding variables. An r of 0.10 represents a weak association, 0.25 a medium association and 0.40 and over represents a strong association. Unstandardised (b) regression coefficients indicate the average change in the dependent variable associated with a 1 unit change in the dependent variable, statistically controlling for the other independent variables. Standardised regression coefficients represent the change being in units of standard deviations to allow comparison across different scales.

‡ Inconsistency refers to differing estimates of effect across studies (i.e. heterogeneity or variability in results) that is not explained by subgroup analyses and therefore reduces confidence in the effect estimate. I² is the percentage of the variability in effect estimates that is due to heterogeneity rather than sampling error (chance) - 0% to 40%: heterogeneity might not be important, 30% to 60%: may represent moderate heterogeneity, 50% to 90%: may represent substantial heterogeneity and 75% to 100%: considerable heterogeneity. I² can be calculated from Q (chi-square) for the test of heterogeneity with the following formula;

$$I^2 = \left(\frac{Q - df}{Q}\right) \times 100\%$$

§ Imprecision refers to wide confidence intervals indicating a lack of confidence in the effect estimate. Based on GRADE recommendations, a result for continuous data (standardised mean differences, not weighted mean differences) is considered imprecise if the upper or lower confidence limit crosses an effect size of 0.5 in either direction, and for binary and correlation data, an effect size of 0.25. GRADE also recommends downgrading the evidence when sample size is smaller than 300 (for binary data) and 400 (for continuous data), although for some topics, these criteria should be relaxed¹⁸.

Indirectness of comparison occurs when a comparison of intervention A versus B is not available but A was compared with C and B was compared with C that allows indirect comparisons of the magnitude of effect of A Indirectness versus B. of population, comparator and/or outcome can also occur when the available evidence regarding a population, intervention, particular comparator, or outcome is not available and is therefore inferred from available evidence. These inferred treatment effect sizes are of lower quality than those gained from head-tohead comparisons of A and B.

Functional magnetic resonance imaging



References

- 1. GRADEWorkingGroup (2004): Grading quality of evidence and strength of recommendations. *British Medical Journal* 328: 1490.
- 2. Alustiza I, Radua J, Pla M, Martin R, Ortuno F (2017): Meta-analysis of functional magnetic resonance imaging studies of timing and cognitive control in schizophrenia and bipolar disorder: Evidence of a primary time deficit. *Schizophrenia Research* 188: 21-32.
- 3. Chen CH, Suckling J, Lennox BR, Ooi C, Bullmore ET (2011): A quantitative meta-analysis of fMRI studies in bipolar disorder. *Bipolar Disorders* 13: 1-15.
- 4. Delvecchio G, Fossati P, Boyer P, Brambilla P, Falkai P, Gruber O, *et al.* (2012): Common and distinct neural correlates of emotional processing in Bipolar Disorder and Major Depressive Disorder: a voxel-based meta-analysis of functional magnetic resonance imaging studies. *European Neuropsychopharmacology* 22: 100-13.
- 5. Delvecchio G, Sugranyes G, Frangou S (2013): Evidence of diagnostic specificity in the neural correlates of facial affect processing in bipolar disorder and schizophrenia: a meta-analysis of functional imaging studies. *Psychological Medicine* 43: 553-69.
- 6. Hajek T, Alda M, Hajek E, Ivanoff J (2013): Functional neuroanatomy of response inhibition in bipolar disorders Combined voxel based and cognitive performance meta-analysis. *Journal of Psychiatric Research* 47: 1955-66.
- 7. Lee MS, Anumagalla P, Talluri P, Pavuluri MN (2014): Meta-analyses of developing brain function in high-risk and emerged bipolar disorder. *Frontiers in Psychiatry* 5: 141.
- 8. Lee MS, Anumagalla P, Talluri P, Pavuluri MN (2018): Attentional engagement increases inferior frontal gyrus activity and mutes limbic activity in pediatric bipolar disorder: Meta-analyses of fMRI studies. *Progress in Neuropsychopharmacology and Biological Psychiatry* May.
- 9. Sprooten E, Rasgon A, Goodman M, Carlin A, Leibu E, Lee WH, *et al.* (2017): Addressing reverse inference in psychiatric neuroimaging: Meta-analyses of task-related brain activation in common mental disorders. *Human Brain Mapping* 38: 1846-64.
- 10. Wegbreit E, Cushman GK, Puzia ME, Weissman AB, Kim KL, Laird AR, et al. (2014): Developmental meta-analyses of the functional neural correlates of bipolar disorder. JAMA Psychiatry 71: 926-35.
- 11. Janiri D, Moser DA, Doucet GE, Luber MJ, Rasgon A, Lee WH, et al. (2020): Shared Neural Phenotypes for Mood and Anxiety Disorders: A Meta-analysis of 226 Task-Related Functional Imaging Studies. JAMA Psychiatry 77: 172-9.
- 12. Tian F, Diao W, Yang X, Wang X, Roberts N, Feng C, *et al.* (2020): Failure of activation of striatum during the performance of executive function tasks in adult patients with bipolar disorder. *Psychological medicine* 50: 653-5.
- 13. Gong J, Chen P, Qi Z, Luo Z, Wang J, Huang L, *et al.* (2021): Large-scale network abnormality in bipolar disorder: A multimodal meta-analysis of resting-state functional and structural magnetic resonance imaging studies. *Journal of Affective Disorders* 292: 9-20.
- 14. Gong J, Qiu S, Chen P, Luo Z, Wang J, Huang L, *et al.* (2020): Common and distinct patterns of intrinsic brain activity alterations in major depression and bipolar disorder: voxel-based meta-analysis. *Translational Psychiatry* 10: 353.
- 15. Yaple ZA, Tolomeo S, Yu R (2021): Mapping working memory-specific dysfunction using a transdiagnostic approach. *NeuroImage: Clinical* 31: 102747.
- 16. CochraneCollaboration (2008): Cochrane Handbook for Systematic Reviews of Interventions. Accessed 24/06/2011.
- 17. Rosenthal JA (1996): Qualitative Descriptors of Strength of Association and Effect Size. *Journal of Social Service Research* 21: 37-59.
- 18. GRADEpro (2008): [Computer program]. Jan Brozek, Andrew Oxman, Holger Schünemann. Version 32 for Windows