Physical activity

Neura Discover. Conquer. Cure. POST-TRAUMATIC STRESS DISORDER LIBRARY

Introduction

Increased physical activity has the potential to improve physical and mental health for people with PTSD. Individuals with serious mental illnesses are more likely to be sedentary than the general population and are consequently at high risk for chronic medical conditions associated with inactivity. Positive psychological effects from physical activity in clinical populations have been reported, including improved quality of life.

Method

We have included only systematic reviews (systematic literature search, detailed methodology with inclusion/exclusion criteria) published in full text, in English, from the year 2010 that report results separately for people with PTSD. Reviews were identified by searching the databases MEDLINE, EMBASE, and PsycINFO. When multiple copies of reviews were found, only the most recent version was included. We prioritised reviews with pooled data for inclusion.

Review reporting assessment was guided by the Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses (PRISMA) checklist that describes a preferred way to present a meta-analysis¹. Reviews with less than 50% of items checked have been excluded from the library. Note that early reviews may have been guided by less stringent reporting checklists than the PRISMA, and that some reviews may have been limited by journal guidelines.

Evidence was graded using the Grading of Recommendations Assessment, Development and Evaluation (GRADE) Working Group approach where high quality evidence such as that gained from randomised controlled trials (RCTs) may be downgraded to moderate or low if review and study quality is limited, if there is inconsistency in results, indirect comparisons, imprecise or sparse data and high probability of reporting bias. It may also be downgraded if risks associated with the intervention or other

matter under review are high. Conversely, low quality evidence such as that gained from observational studies may be upgraded if effect sizes are large or if there is a dose dependent response. We have also taken into account sample size and whether results are consistent, precise and direct with low associated risks (see end of table for an explanation of these terms)². The resulting table represents an objective summary of the available evidence, although the conclusions are solely the opinion of staff of NeuRA (Neuroscience Research Australia).

Results

We found three systematic reviews that met our inclusion criteria³⁻⁵.

- Moderate quality evidence found lower levels of physical activity in people with PTSD compared to people without PTSD.
- Lower levels of physical activity were associated with more PTSD symptoms, particularly hyperarousal symptoms. There may also be more depression symptoms and poorer sleep quality in those with low physical activity levels.



Physical activity

Hall KS, Hoerster KD, Yancy WS

Post-traumatic stress disorder, physical activity, and eating behaviors

Epidemiologic Reviews 2015; 37: 103-15

View review abstract online

Comparison	Physical activity in people with PTSD.
Summary of evidence	Moderate quality evidence (large overall sample, appears inconsistent, unable to assess precision, direct) found less physical activity in people with PTSD than in people without PTSD, and exercise can have beneficial effects on PTSD symptoms.

Physical activity

15 studies, N = 556,645

- 4 out of 7 studies found that adults with PTSD were significantly less likely to engage in regular physical activity compared with those without PTSD.
- 2 out of 5 studies reported an association between increased PTSD symptoms and decreased physical activity.

3 studies found beneficial effects of exercise on PTSD symptoms.

1 study found a decrease in exercise over time was related to delayed onset of PTSD and a lower likelihood of recovery from PTSD.

Consistency in results‡	Appears inconsistent
Precision in results§	Unable to assess; no measure of precision is reported.
Directness of results	Direct

Vancampfort D, Richards J, Stubbs B, Akello G, Gbiri CA, Ward PB, Rosenbaum S

Physical Activity in People With Posttraumatic Stress Disorder: A Systematic Review of Correlates

Journal of Physical Activity and Health 2016; 13: 910-8

View review abstract online

Comparison	Physical activity in people with PTSD.
•	



Physical activity

Summary of evidence	Moderate quality evidence (large overall sample, mostly inconsistent, unable to assess precision, direct) found lower levels of physical activity was associated with more PTSD symptoms, particularly hyperarousal symptoms. There may also be more depression symptoms and poorer sleep quality in those with low physical activity levels.
---------------------	-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Physical activity

8 studies, N = 1,368

3/5 studies found that lower physical activity was associated with more PTSD symptoms.

4/4 studies found that lower physical activity was associated with more hyperarousal symptoms.

3/4 studies found that lower physical activity was associated with poorer sleep quality.

2/4 studies found that lower physical activity was associated with more depression symptoms.

1/4 studies found that lower physical activity was associated with more re-experiencing symptoms.

1/4 studies found that lower physical activity was associated with more avoidance symptoms.

1/1 study found that lower physical activity was associated with poorer quality of life.

1/1 study found that lower physical activity was associated with more anxiety symptoms.

1/1 study found that lower physical activity was associated with more suicidal thoughts.

1/1 study found that lower physical activity was associated with more fibromyalgia.

Consistency in results	Appears inconsistent, apart from hyperarousal symptoms.
Precision in results	Unable to assess; no measure of precision is reported.
Directness of results	Direct

van den Berk-Clark C, Secrest S, Walls J, Hallberg E, Lustman PJ, Schneider FD, Scherrer, J. F.

Association between posttraumatic stress disorder and lack of exercise, poor diet, obesity, and co-occuring smoking: A systematic review and meta-analysis

Health Psychology 2018; 37: 407-16

View review abstract online

Comparison	Physical activity in people with PTSD compared to people without PTSD.
Summary of evidence	Moderate quality evidence (large sample, precise, direct) finds a



Physical activity

	small effect of less physical activity in people with PTSD.	
Physical activity		
A small effect of less physical activity in people with PTSD;		
12 studies, N = 651,078, OR = 0.69, 95%CI 0.68 to 0.71		
Results were similar in the analysis of studies that controlled for possible confounders (age, gender, chronic disease, mental health factors, and/or marital status).		
Consistency in results	No measure of consistency is reported.	
Precision in results	Precise	
Directness of results	Direct	

Explanation of acronyms

CI = confidence interval, N = number of participants, OR = odds ratio

Physical activity

Neura Discover. Conquer. Cure.

Explanation of technical terms

Bias has the potential to affect reviews of both RCT and observational studies. Forms of bias include; reporting bias - selective reporting of results; publication bias - trials that are not formally published tend to show less effect than published trials, further if there are statistically significant differences between groups in a trial, these trial results tend to get published before those of trials without significant differences; language bias - only including English language reports; funding bias - source of funding for the primary research with selective reporting of results within primary studies; outcome variable selection bias: database bias including reports from some databases and not others; citation bias - preferential citation of authors. Trials can also be subject to bias when evaluators are not blind to treatment condition and selection bias of participants if trial samples are small⁶.

† Different effect measures are reported by different reviews.

Prevalence refers to how many existing cases there are at a particular point in time. Incidence refers to how many new cases there are per population in a specified time period. Incidence is usually reported as the number of new cases per 100,000 people per year. Alternatively some studies present the number of new cases that have accumulated over several years against a person-years denominator. This denominator is the sum of individual units of time that the persons in the population are at risk of becoming a case. It takes into account the size of the underlying population sample and its age structure over the duration of observation.

Reliability and validity refers to how accurate the instrument is. Sensitivity is the proportion of actual positives that are correctly identified (100% sensitivity = correct identification of all actual positives) and specificity is the proportion of negatives that are correctly identified (100% specificity = not identifying anyone as positive if they are truly not).

Weighted mean difference scores refer to mean differences between treatment and comparison groups after treatment (or occasionally pre to post treatment) and in a randomised trial there is an assumption that both groups are comparable on this measure prior to treatment. Standardised mean differences are divided by the pooled standard deviation (or the standard deviation of one group when groups are homogenous) that allows results from different scales to be combined and compared. Each study's mean difference is then given a weighting depending on the size of the sample and the variability in the data. Less than 0.4 represents a small effect, around 0.5 a medium effect, and over 0.8 represents a large effect⁶.

Odds ratio (OR) or relative risk (RR) refers to the probability of a reduction (< 1) or an increase (> 1) in a particular outcome in a treatment group, or a group exposed to a risk factor, relative to the comparison group. For example, a RR of 0.75 translates to a reduction in risk of an outcome of 25% relative to those not receiving the treatment or not exposed to the risk factor. Conversely, a RR of 1.25 translates to an increased risk of 25% relative to those not receiving treatment or not having been exposed to a risk factor. A RR or OR of 1.00 means there is no difference between groups. A medium effect is considered if RR > 2 or < 0.5 and a large effect if RR > 5 or $< 0.2^7$. InOR stands for logarithmic OR where a InOR of 0 shows no difference between groups. Hazard ratios measure the effect of an explanatory variable on the hazard or risk of an event.

Correlation coefficients (eg, r) indicate the strength of association or relationship

Physical activity



between variables. They can provide an indirect indication of prediction, but do not confirm causality due to possible and often unforseen confounding variables. An r of 0.10 represents a weak association, 0.25 a medium association and 0.40 and over represents а strona association. Unstandardised (b) regression coefficients indicate the average change in the dependent variable associated with a 1 unit change in independent variable, statistically the other independent controlling for variables. Standardised regression coefficients represent the change being in of standard deviations to allow comparison across different scales.

‡ Inconsistency refers to differing estimates of effect across studies (i.e. heterogeneity or variability in results) is not explained by subgroup analyses and therefore reduces confidence in the effect estimate. I2 is the percentage of the variability in effect estimates that is due to heterogeneity rather than sampling error (chance) - 0% to 40%: heterogeneity might not be important, 30% to 60%: may represent moderate heterogeneity, 50% to 90%: may represent considerable heterogeneity and over this is considerable heterogeneity. l² can calculated from Q (chi-square) for the test of heterogeneity with the following formula6;

$$I^2 = \left(\frac{Q - df}{Q}\right) \times 100\%$$

§ Imprecision refers to wide confidence intervals indicating a lack of confidence in the effect estimate. Based on GRADE recommendations, a result for continuous data (standardised mean differences, not weighted mean differences) is considered imprecise if the upper or lower confidence

limit crosses an effect size of 0.5 in either direction, and for binary and correlation data, an effect size of 0.25. GRADE also recommends downgrading the evidence when sample size is smaller than 300 (for binary data) and 400 (for continuous data), although for some topics, these criteria should be relaxed⁸.

Indirectness of comparison occurs when a comparison of intervention A versus B is not available but A was compared with C and B was compared with C that allows indirect comparisons of the magnitude of effect of A versus B. Indirectness population, of comparator and/or outcome can also occur when the available evidence regarding a particular population, intervention, comparator, or outcome is not available and is therefore inferred from available evidence. These inferred treatment effect sizes are of lower quality than those gained from head-tohead comparisons of A and B.

Neura Discover. Conquer. Cure.

Physical activity

References

- Moher D, Liberati A, Tetzlaff J, Altman DG, PRISMAGroup (2009): Preferred reporting items for systematic reviews and meta-analyses: the PRISMA statement. *British Medical Journal* 151: 264-9.
- 2. GRADEWorkingGroup (2004): Grading quality of evidence and strength of recommendations. *British Medical Journal* 328: 1490.
- 3. Hall KS, Hoerster KD, Yancy WS, Jr. (2015): Post-traumatic stress disorder, physical activity, and eating behaviors. *Epidemiologic Reviews* 37: 103-15.
- 4. Vancampfort D, Richards J, Stubbs B, Akello G, Gbiri CA, Ward PB, *et al.* (2016): Physical Activity in People With Posttraumatic Stress Disorder: A Systematic Review of Correlates. *Journal of Physical Activity and Health* 13: 910-8.
- 5. van den Berk-Clark C, Secrest S, Walls J, Hallberg E, Lustman PJ, Schneider FD, et al. (2018): Association between posttraumatic stress disorder and lack of exercise, poor diet, obesity, and cooccuring smoking: A systematic review and meta-analysis. *Health Psychology* 37: 407-16.
- 6. CochraneCollaboration (2008): Cochrane Handbook for Systematic Reviews of Interventions. Accessed 24/06/2011.
- 7. Rosenthal JA (1996): Qualitative Descriptors of Strength of Association and Effect Size. *Journal of Social Service Research* 21: 37-59.
- 8. GRADEpro (2008): [Computer program]. Jan Brozek, Andrew Oxman, Holger Schünemann. *Version* 32 for Windows